**COMHAIRLE CONTAE ÁTHA CLIATH THEAS  
SOUTH DUBLIN COUNTY COUNCIL**



**Minute of Environment Public Realm & Climate Change SPC Meeting held on 5th September 2017 in IT Conference Room**

**In attendance**

**Elected Members**

Councillor Brian Lawlor

Councillor Enda Fanning

Councillor Danny O’Brien

Councillor Frances Timmons

**Officials**

Teresa Walsh, Director of Service

Chris Galvin, Senior Engineer

Mary Maguire, SEO

Sorcha O’Brien, EAO

Nicola Lawler, AO

**Apology**

Councillor Pamela Kearns

Connie Kiernan

As Cathaoirleach Councillor Pamela Kearns was unable to attend, Councillor Frances Timmons presided, on proposition of Councillor Timmons, seconded by Councillor Danny O’Brien.

**Item 1: Minutes of Environment SPC meeting held on 6th February 2017**

The Minutes of Environment SPC meeting held on 1**6th May 2017,** were proposed by Councillor D. O’ Brien, seconded by Councillor Enda Fanning

**Item 2: Update on Flood Alleviation Schemes and Surface Water Schemes**

The following report as circulated was NOTED:

**Ballycullen Stream Flood Alleviation Scheme**

Following a number of flooding events in the Castlefield area, the Drainage Section of the Council has examined the flooding problem and after reviewing various options it has concluded that a duplication of the existing culvert is the preferred solution to alleviate flooding in the area. The contract for the construction of this scheme was awarded to Clonmel Enterprises Ltd. in February. Works have progressed well on site and the project is approximately 75% complete on. The project is expected to be complete in Q4 2017, a 12 month defects period will follow the final completion.

**River Poddle Flood Alleviation Scheme**

Following the severe flooding event of 24/25th October 2011 the OPW agreed and provided the extra funding to undertake the Catchment Flood Risk Assessment & Management Study (CFRAMS) of the Poddle. The final report on these was forwarded to the OPW who has since approved the Draft Design Brief for the River Poddle Flood Alleviation Scheme. The appointment of consultants is expected in early September. The letter of intent and the letters to the unsuccessful tenderers have been issued and subject to no objection or appeal, a consultant will be appointed in early September. The scheme is estimated to cost in the region of €6 million.

**Camac Flood Alleviation Scheme**

The overall scheme for the Camac did not meet the OPW cost benefit criteria to progress work on the river in its entirety. A steering group has been set up to consider works at specific locations on the Camac River, SDCC and the OPW have met on site and walked the Camac. A brief for the appointment of Consultants to carry out the design of flood alleviation measures at these specific locations is currently being drafted.

**Whitechurch Stream Flood Alleviation Scheme**

As part of the Dodder CFRAMS there is a proposed scheme for the Whitechurch Stream. The OPW have confirmed funding for the procurement of a consultant engineer for the scheme. We are currently drafting a design brief for this and will submit the brief when complete to the OPW prior to engaging the consultant through the DCC framework.

**Surface Water Minor Capital Works – 2017**

Provision has been made for the following SW Minor Capital works and assessments to be carried out during 2017.

* Tay Lane, Rathcoole – **design re-assessment underway.**
* Ballynakelly ‘Garage’ at Newcastle Manor, Newcastle – **Works complete.**
* Main Street, Peamount Road, Newcastle – **not commenced.**
* Old Lucan Road, Lucan **– This is an extensive scheme. The scheme commenced during school summer holidays, main works complete, connections and resurfacing remaining. Resurfacing currently planned for the schools mid-term break.**
* Ballyowen Lane, Lucan in conjunction with Public Realm and the Roads Department – **PR to carry out pitch drainage separately. Main drainage works complete.**
* Templeogue Village – initial assessment and feasibility study in conjunction with the Roads Department – **Liaison with Roads department ongoing, also awaiting finalisation of MoU with Irish Water.**
* Stocking Lane, Rathfarnham – **not commenced.**
* Orchard Road, Clondalkin – **Works complete**.
* Nangor Road/Ninth Lock Road Junction, Clondalkin – **not commenced, to be re-assessed and deferred into the 2018 programme.**
* Cookstown Industrial Estate, Tallaght – **Works Complete.**
* Poddle Lakelands screen **– Awaiting delivery of screen which is to be replaced in late September**

**Ongoing works**

Provision has been made for ongoing maintenance works to address pluvial and other flooding issues at various locations such as the following rivers and streams;

 Camac River

* Poddle River clearing
* Jobstown Stream
* Whitechurch Stream
* Owendoher stream

**END OF REPORT TO SPC**

Teresa Walsh and Chris Galvin responded to queries raised which primarily referred to delay with appointing contractor for the Poddle Scheme and the progress with advancing the Camac scheme. Members commended the recent work on Orchard Road

**Item 3: Climate Change – Update on Adaptation and Mitigation Plan**

The following report as circulated was NOTED:

Strategy Towards Climate Change Action Plans for Dublin Local Authorities’, which was adopted at the Council Meeting in February 2017.

SDCC must now produce an Adaptation Plan and a Mitigation Plan. Adaptation to climate change and the successful implementation of adaptation policy, is a task that involves all levels of government from local to European levels. At local level, our task is to focus on the implementation of adaptation responses. Strengthening our capacity to adapt to unavoidable climate change impacts by making our county more resilient to extreme weather events.

Mitigation to climate change tasks local government to make efforts to reduce or prevent emission of greenhouse gases, this can be achieved through improved energy efficiency and greater use of renewable energy sources. SDCC in conjunction with the three other Dublin Local Authorities and Codema, are producing these plans. We are currently meeting all sections of the Local Authority and generating a list of actions required to adapt to and mitigate the challenge of Climate Change.

Codema have been carrying out one-to- one meeting with all relevant Climate Change working group nominees in SDCC and are drafting the Adaptation and Mitigation plans from the outcomes of these meetings in addition to the workshops.

A workshop took place in DLR on 29/06/17, the findings of which were presented at the Dublin Region Environment SPC on 05/07/17.

SDCC, in conjunction with Codema and the other Dublin Local Authorities are hosting a further Climate Change workshop in September, to further explore and come to a consensus on mitigation measures and how they can be implemented across the Dublin Region. Adaptation plans will be more specific for each LA, given the geographic locations of the LA’s and the different challenges faced in each area, e.g. DCC, DLR & Fingal will have coastal adaptation challenges, SDCC will have pluvial and fluvial flooding issues to consider.

**END OF REPORT TO SPC**

A discussion ensued with contributions from members. Teresa Walsh responded to queries raised primarily in relation to the expected National Adaptation Framework which is expected in December 2017 and the individual adaption plans likely. However it was reiterated that there will be a Dublin Region Mitigation Plan.

It was noted that it is likely that there will be a Joint (DLA) SPC meeting to finalise draft Mitigation Plan before the commencement of the public consultation process.

**Item 4: Draft Burial Ground Strategy**

A presentation as circulated which focused on the following was noted:

* Recent review of operations / costs / activity / requests for memorial benches
* Capacity at cemeteries
* Future development

A discussion ensued with contributions regarding the proposal submitted to “Have Your Say” for a Men’s Shed at the old vacant caretaker’s cottage Esker Cemetery. This will be considered separate to the Burial Grounds Review and Strategy and a report will be prepared and circulated to the Lucan Area Committee.

Other main issue discussed related to the potential consolidation of plot purchase and headstone permit, and a comparison of neighboring local authority costs. It was agreed to bring this related matter to the November OP&F meeting.

**Item 5: Item referred from July Council - A deposit refund scheme for recyclables**

The following report as circulated was NOTED

**Introduction**

Wikipedia describes a reverse vending machine as a device that accepts used (empty) [beverage containers](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Beverage_containers) and returns money (a deposit return scheme) or coupons (a non - deposit return scheme) to the user. The machines are popular in places that have mandatory [recycling](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recycling) laws or [container deposit legislation](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Container_deposit_legislation).

**SDCC historical**

In 2008 as part of an SDCC Environmental Awareness campaign to encourage recycling by residents and school children, a reverse vending machine was placed in a school and community center. The reverse vending machines were leased from a company called Reuse Reward Limited/GreenTown and a service agreement was put in place. The cost per annum for the delivery, installation, lease and maintenance of two reverse vending machines was €9,505.76.

Reuse Reward Limited/GreenTown ceased trading on 11th February 2010. This resulted in the removal of reverse vending machines and cessation of supply of same.

**Motion 10 July 2017**

Following from [motion 10](http://intranet/cmas/documentsview.aspx?id=56403) at the July Council meeting contact was made with the Eastern Midlands Waste Region (Prevention) Office and Repak to discuss a deposit/non-deposit return scheme in South Dublin. In addition SDCC contacted Reverse Vending Corporation in the UK regarding the possibility of engaging with SDCC on a pilot project and the placement of a reverse vending machine within the county.

The findings were as follows:

**Eastern Midlands Waste Region Prevention Office**

In collaboration with the local authorities, Eastern Midlands Waste Region Prevention Office run a range of environmental education and awareness programmes. These programmes are designed to encourage and empower households and communities to minimise waste, reuse materials and recycle.

The Eastern Midland Waste Regional (prevention) office advised to make direct contact with Repak and provided contact detail within Repak and access to research documentation.

**Repak:**

Repak is a not for profit company set up by Irish businesses and owned by its members. It is approved under licensed from DCCE to operate a compliance scheme for packaging recovery.

Following initial discussion with Repak, the following written response was received

“With respect to your specific query on the “The feasibility of introducing a deposit return system into South Dublin County”. There is no visibility on detail on what is being proposed in the “[Waste Reduction Bill](https://scanmail.trustwave.com/?c=6600&d=8amN2Wp4hIZrTfWVsnBhnanvM4MdgWfEbGluv_ZAwA&s=344&u=https%3a%2f%2fwww%2eoireachtas%2eie%2fdocuments%2fbills28%2fbills%2f2017%2f8017%2fb8017d%2epdf)” – consequently we are unable to advise.

However, in general with regard to the introduction of National Deposit and Return System as proposed in the [Waste Reduction Bill](https://scanmail.trustwave.com/?c=6600&d=8amN2Wp4hIZrTfWVsnBhnanvM4MdgWfEbGluv_ZAwA&s=344&u=https%3a%2f%2fwww%2eoireachtas%2eie%2fdocuments%2fbills28%2fbills%2f2017%2f8017%2fb8017d%2epdf) under consideration we would comment as follows:-

* Recycling of sub –components of packaging material waste streams such as Metal cans and Plastic Bottles are above European norms;
* The successful producer responsibility system exceeds national recycling targets for all packaging;
* The environmental benefit gains would be disproportionate to the cost and knock on impacts on other waste packaging streams;
* Fees paid for metal can recycling under deposit systems are significantly (2-3 times) higher than that paid to producer responsibility organisations;
* Of the 27 member States in the Union only has five have Deposit and Return Systems, Ireland in terms recycling is ahead of all bar one of these Member States;
* Litter problems even with a Deposit Return System would remain. Litter is “behavioural” issue. Drinks cans in any event makes up a very small percentage of the total street litter (1.2%);
* The establishment of a national network of Deposit Return System would need power supply and security. Even in standby mode energy, consumption is required with associated environmental footprint together with serving (emptying) and maintenance;
* Planning permission may be required adding to a complex and costly rollout of Deposit Return systems, who will be responsible for managing such systems, Local Authority’s?;
* Further, this will be exacerbated via different VAT rates and excise duties between member states, let alone non-EU countries.

This subject within the Irish and European Union context has been considered thoroughly.

For your information and reference, the table below lists relevant documents. These are all available for down load.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Title** | **Author(s)** | **Date Published** |
| Repak Annual Report 2016 – Membership Adding Value.  Source:http://repak.wpengine.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/Repak-Annual-Report-2016.pdf | Repak | May 2017 |
|  |  |  |
| Review of the Producer Responsibility Initiative Model in Ireland A Packaging Levy for Ireland?  Source: https://www.esri.ie/pubs/BKMNEXT270.pdf | Paul K Gorecki, Economic and Social Research Institute and Department of Economics, Trinity College Dublin | 1st May 2013 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| PRO EUROPE’s position in a European refund system for Metal Beverage Cans  Source:http://www.pro-e.org/files/11-07\_PRO-EUROPE-position-paper-on-refund-systems.pdf | PRO Europe s.p.r.l. (Packaging Recovery Organisation Europe) | 5th April 2012 |
| Options and Feasibility of a European Refund System for Metal Beverage Cans  Source: [http://ec.europa.eu/environment/waste/packaging/cans/pdf](http://scanmail.trustwave.com/?c=6600&d=8amN2Wp4hIZrTfWVsnBhnanvM4MdgWfEbGk67KERmg&s=344&u=http%3a%2f%2fec%2eeuropa%2eeu%2fenvironment%2fwaste%2fpackaging%2fcans%2fpdf) | Dominic Hogg, Tim Elliott, Simon Croasdell,  Ann Ballinger, Thomas Vergunst, Chris Cullen, Leila Bendali - Eunomia Research & Consulting Ltd | 16th November 2011 |
|  |  |  |
| Study On The Progress Of The Implementation And Impact Of Directive 94/62/EC On The Functioning Of The Internal Market:  Source: [http://www.pedz.uni-mannheim.de/daten/edz-h/gdb/05/report\_packaging\_direct.pdf](http://scanmail.trustwave.com/?c=6600&d=8amN2Wp4hIZrTfWVsnBhnanvM4MdgWfEbDhp7qNHlw&s=344&u=http%3a%2f%2fwww%2epedz%2euni-mannheim%2ede%2fdaten%2fedz-h%2fgdb%2f05%2freport%5fpackaging%5fdirect%2epdf) | David Perchard Perchards, Gill Bevington St Albans, UK  Fred Somers FFact Management Consultants, Kees Wielenga Rijen, The Netherlands  Raphael Veit SAGIS Ltd, Sliema, Malta | 6th May 2005 |
|  |  |  |
| The National Litter Pollution Monitoring System Litter Monitoring Body System Results 2015 | The Litter Monitoring Body, TOBIN Consulting Engineers, Block 10-4, Blanchardstown Corporate Park, Dublin 15. | April 2016 |

[Research](https://scanmail.trustwave.com/?c=6600&d=97qB2V_yHybXzkPj8aUxSSLJD7KwG_9ruAK8gLq8Ig&s=344&u=https%3a%2f%2frepak%2ewpengine%2ecom%2fwp-content%2fuploads%2f2015%2f06%2fDeposits%5ffor%5fIreland%5fSeptember%5f2008%5ffinal%2epdf) commissioned by Repak, based on a brief for a study being commissioned by the Department of Environment, Heritage and Local Government (DoEHLG) into future waste management policy in Irelandindicates that EU States as referred to above where the Refundable Deposit Scheme exists are significantly subsidized by central government.

**Reverse Vending Corporation, UK**

In July / August 2017 contact was made withReverse Vending Corporation in the UK, previous supplier to the company Reuse Reward Limited/GreenTown who are referred to in the earlier part of this report (previous pilot 2008).

Reverse Vending Corporation in the UK responded that they no longer supply Reverse Vending Machines in Non-Deposit Markets and the company Reuse Reward Limited/GreenTown are no longer in business. However Reverse Vending Corporation will retain the Councils details and revert should a national Deposit Return Scheme in Ireland

Anecdotal evidence from Reverse Vending Corporation who have been in the industry for 35 years indicate that non-deposit vending machines which provide rewards as opposed to cash work well for 8 / 10 months after which time they are subject to antisocial behavior and heavy drop off in use.

**Conclusions**

It would appear that the introduction of a non-deposit return scheme for recyclables is not currently possible due to the following:

* Currently there is no supplier available to provide a receptacle in an EU jurisdiction which does not have a national Deposit Return Scheme

Should a supplier be sourced from outside of the UK the following implementation / management issues would also need to be considered:

* 1. Servicing - Mechanical and electrical maintenance
  2. Routine cleaning and emptying of the receptacle
  3. Financial management – stocking of coins
  4. Operational risks - vandal proof
  5. Budget for refund scheme

**END OF REPORT TO SPC**

A discussion ensued with contributions from all present.

Teresa Walsh, Sorcha O’Brien and Mary Maguire responded to queries raised in relation to how a “local” scheme with a social enterprise focus might have worked if a supplier for a receptacle could have been identified. The position will be revisited if there is a change on the national position.

Mary Maguire advised of the pilot initiative and availability of reusable drinking bottles instead of regular plastic bottles of water / drinks for clubs.

The discussion was also focused on certain non-recyclable goods including mattresses, which cannot be recycled at Civic Amenity sites, and which are a blight on the local landscape. It was noted that this is of concern to Regional Waste Prevention Offices and needs to be addressed through the industry.

On a positive note, it was however noted that Ireland is performing very well in its recycling endeavours.

**Item 6 – Item referred from May Meeting - Control of Horses**

The following report as circulated was NOTED

As requested by full Council in May 2017, and as previously outlined,  a number of key stakeholders from across the Dublin Region have formed a working been liaising over the summer months.

The broad purpose / role of the group, established on 22nd August 2017 by South Dublin County Council in collaboration with the Department of Agriculture Food & the Marine, Dublin City Council, Fingal County Council and An Garda Siochana, is to develop a concerted collaborative programme aimed at promoting a facilitating responsible horse ownership across the Dublin region with a particular focus on the following issues:

1. Indiscriminate breeding,
2. Animal welfare,
3. Education and awareness,
4. Legislation and regulation (acts and Byelaws) pertaining to animal welfare and control of horses.

Membership of the group includes:

1. Dublin Local Authorities - SDCC / DCC/FCC
2. Department of Agriculture, Food & Marine
3. An Garda Siochana
4. DSPCA
5. Fettercairn Youth Horse Project
6. Clondalkin Equine Club
7. Youth Service
8. Traveller Development Groups
9. Voluntary groups/rescue centres
10. UCD Veterinary Services

Membership Numbers are restricted to 2 members per Statutory Body and 1 member per voluntary group/rescue center. However, given their voluntary nature and consequent restrictions on availability, attendees from non-statutory / voluntary groups may rotate.

Sub-committees/task groups will be established to research and address various time bound tasks/bodies of work. These sub-committees will disband when those tasks are completed.

Initially 4 task groups will be established to research and address the 4 main topics referred to as follows:

1. Indiscriminate breeding,
2. Animal welfare,
3. Education and awareness,
4. Legislation and regulation (acts and Byelaws) pertaining to animal welfare and control of horses.

Non-members with specific experience or knowledge may be invited to sit / work with task group meetings on an ex officio basis but will not however be members of the Dublin Region Horse Welfare Working Group

Working groups will report back on activities primarily via working group lead- to be determined for each working group.

Initially meetings of the **Dublin Region Horse Welfare Working Group** will be held monthly. Once the group is established meetings will be held quarterly – locations will vary to accommodate as many members of the group as possible

Sub-committees / task groups may meet monthly or more often, depending on the need.

South Dublin County Council (as Lead Authority) will organise and chair the meetings, and provide secretariat services.

The next meeting of the Dublin Region Horse Welfare Working Group will be held on Tuesday 26 th September 2017.

It is a matter for the SPC to consider representation on the Dublin Region Horse Welfare Working Group.

**END OF REPORT TO SPC**

A discussion ensued and Teresa Walsh also advised of a recently formed CCMA working group to consider the issue of urban horse ownership. Problems being experienced at Clonburris lands was also noted.

Councillor Frances Timmons expressed an interest in representing the SPC on the new Dublin Region Horse Welfare Working Group, and it was also agreed to seek expressions of interest from any other elected member(s) who may be interested in engaging on one of the working groups.

There being no further business, the meeting concluded at 19.00